

TO EDIT OR NOT TO EDIT

*Pune Indological Series*

I

Editorial Board

Mahesh DEOKAR

*Editor-in-Chief*

Shrikant BAHULKAR (Bhandarkar Oriental Research Institute)

Lata Mahesh DEOKAR (Savitribai Phule Pune University)

Dragomir DIMITROV (Philipps-Universität Marburg)

Aditya Prakashan

SAVITRIBAI PHULE PUNE UNIVERSITY  
DEPARTMENT OF PALI  
*Pune Indological Series*  
I

Jürgen Hanneder

# TO EDIT OR NOT TO EDIT

On Textual Criticism of Sanskrit Works

A series of lectures delivered at  
the École Pratique des Hautes Études  
Paris, March 2015

and

the Department of Pali,  
Savitribai Phule Pune University  
Pune, October and November 2015



Pune 2017

ISBN 978-81-7742-164-4

Copyright © 2017 Jürgen Hanneder

ALL RIGHTS RESERVED

Typeset by Jürgen Hanneder  
Cover design by Shantipriya

Published by Aditya Prakashan  
2/18 Ansari Road, New Delhi-110 002, India  
[www.adityapublishers.com](http://www.adityapublishers.com)  
[contact@adityapublishers.com](mailto:contact@adityapublishers.com)  
Printed in India

## EDITORIAL NOTE

The idea to establish the *Pune Indological Series* arose in the autumn of 2015 during a course of lectures delivered at the Department of Pali of the Savitribai Phule Pune University. Under the Khyentse Foundation Visiting Professorship Programme, which was made possible with the generous support of Ven. Dzongsar Khyentse Rinpoche and the Khyentse Foundation-India, Prof. Dr. Jürgen Hanneder (Philipps-Universität Marburg, Germany) was invited as the first Visiting Professor, and during his stay from October to November 2015 he offered in Pune a highly instructive course on textual criticism. I am very happy that our wish to have our own departmental series to be inaugurated with the publication of Prof. Hanneder's lectures has come to fruition now in the form of the first volume of the *Pune Indological Series*. In this newly established series we intend to publish high-quality research work in the field of Indology, focusing primarily but not exclusively on Buddhist Studies carried out at the Department of Pali or in collaboration with it. I am very grateful to our first contributor, to the editorial board, as well as to Mr. Aditya Goel of the Aditya Prakashan in New Delhi who with great enthusiasm and willingness has taken the responsibility of publishing and distributing the *Pune Indological Series*. More volumes will follow soon, and I hope that the academic community both in India and abroad will appreciate these contributions.

Mahesh A. Deokar  
*Editor-in-Chief*



## CONTENTS

Preface .....	ix
---------------	----

### **The Unknown World of Inedita**

La Mancha to Śrīnagara – The Translation of the Ḍān Kvikṣoṭa .....	2
“Surpassing Bāṇa’s Style” – Two Kashmirian Authors of the Nineteenth Century .....	24
From Persian to Sanskrit .....	34

### **How to Edit**

European Textual Criticism .....	52
The Insistence on Stemmatology .....	72
Author Variants and the Hand of the Copy Editor .....	75
Kṣemarāja, the Editor .....	79
Premodern Indian Textual Criticism .....	83
Textual Criticism in Early Indology .....	103
Early Indological Editions .....	127
Lachmann .....	134
Indological Solutions .....	138
The Pitfalls of Editing .....	153
Some Text-Critical Principles in Practice .....	165
Text-Critical Theory .....	174

### **Editing Sāhib Kaul’s Works**

The Author and His Works .....	196
How to Understand Devotional Stotras? .....	198
Mystical Experience .....	202
The Citsphārasārādvaya .....	215
The Dynamic Text – Sāhib Kaul’s Ritual Manual .....	221
Résumé .....	228
Further Reading .....	230